Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ

Document 2-2

Filed 01/21/2010

Page 1 of 88



1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			S DISTRICT COURT
8	16	T SEAT	CICT OF WASHINGTON TTLE
9			
10	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, Plaintiff, and COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS, ET AL. Plaintiff-Intervenors,	) ) ) )	Civil Action No 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ  CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF
12	v. SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC.	)	AMERICA AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC.
13	Defendant.	)	
14			
15			
16	·		
17			
18			
19			
20			

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC.  $\,-\,1$ 

UNITED STATES ATTORNEY
5220 United States Courthouse
700 Stewart Street
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-1271
(206) 553-7970

Page 2 of 88



1		TABLE OF CONTENTS:	
2	I.	JURISDICTION AND VENUE	8
3	II.	APPLICABILITY	10
4	III.	DEFINITIONS	11
5	IV.	INJUNCTIVE RELIEF	29
6	V.	CIVIL PENALTY	103
7	VI.	SUPPLEMENTAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROJECTS	107
8	VII.	EMISSION CREDIT GENERATION	110
9	VIII.	PERMITS	112
10	IX.	REPORTING REQUIREMENTS	114
11	X.	REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF SUBMITTALS	118
12	XI.	STIPULATED PENALTIES	120
13	XII.	FORCE MAJEURE	126
14	XIII.	DISPUTE RESOLUTION	128
15	XIV.	INFORMATION COLLECTION AND RETENTION	132
16	XV.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT / RESERVATION OF RIGHTS	134
17	XVI.	COSTS	138
18	XVII.	NOTICES	139
19	XVIII.	SALES OR TRANSFERS OF OPERATIONAL OR OWNERSHIP	
20		INTERESTS	146

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. — 2

UNITED STATES ATTORNEY
5220 United States Courthouse
700 Stewart Street
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-1271
(206) 553-7970

## Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ

### Document 2-2

## Filed 01/21/2010

# Page 3 of 88



1	XIX.	EFFECTIVE DATE	.147
2	XX.	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION	.148
3	XXI.	MODIFICATION	.148
4	XXII.	GENERAL PROVISIONS	.149
5	XXIII.	TERMINATION	.151
6	XXIV.	PUBLIC PARTICIPATION	.152
7	XXV.	SIGNATORIES AND SERVICE	.153
8	XXVI.	INTEGRATION	.154
9	XXVII.	FINAL JUDGMENT	.154

10

1	WHEREAS, Plaintiff United States of America, on behalf of the United
2	States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and Plaintiff-Intervenors,
3	Commonwealth of Massachusetts; Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Department of
4	Environmental Protection; State of North Carolina; State of Illinois; State of
5	Indiana and its Department of Environmental Management; State of Wisconsin;
6	Oklahoma Department of Environmental Quality; the State of Louisiana, on behalf
7	of the Louisiana Department of Environmental Quality; State of Missouri,
8	Department of Natural Resources; Washington State Department of Ecology;
9	Puget Sound Clean Air Agency, and San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution
10	Control District have filed Complaints concurrently with this Consent Decree,
11	alleging that Saint-Gobain Containers, Inc. (SGCI), violated and/or continues to
12	violate Section 165, 42 U.S.C. § 7475, of the Clean Air Act (CAA or Act), 42
13	U.S.C. § 7401 et seq., with respect to emissions of nitrogen oxides, sulfur dioxide,
14	and particulate matter;
15	WHEREAS, the Complaints against SGCI sought injunctive relief and the
16	assessment of civil penalties for alleged violations of the Prevention of Significant
17	Deterioration (PSD) and Nonattainment New Source Review (NNSR) provisions
18	in Part C and D of Subchapter I of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7470-7492, 7501-7515,
19	and federally-enforceable state implementation plans developed by Massachusetts,



1	New Jersey, Pennsylvania, North Carolina, Illinois, Indiana, Wisconsin, Texas,
2	Oklahoma, Louisiana, Missouri, Washington and California;
3	WHEREAS, Commonwealth of Massachusetts; Commonwealth of
4	Pennsylvania, Department of Environmental Protection; State of North Carolina;
5	State of Illinois; State of Indiana and its Department of Environmental
6	Management; State of Wisconsin; Oklahoma Department of Environmental
7	Quality; the State of Louisiana, on behalf of the Louisiana Department of
8	Environmental Quality; State of Missouri, Department of Natural Resources;
9	Washington State Department of Ecology; Puget Sound Clean Air Agency, and
10	San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District have joined in this
11	matter alleging violations of their respective applicable implementation provisions
12	and/or other state and/or local rules and regulations incorporating and
13	implementing the foregoing federal requirements;
14	WHEREAS, EPA issued a notice of violation (NOV) to SGCI with respect
15	to such allegations on January 13, 2009;
16	WHEREAS, EPA provided SGCI and Commonwealth of Massachusetts;
17	New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection; Commonwealth of
18	Pennsylvania, Department of Environmental Protection; State of North Carolina;
19	State of Illinois; State of Indiana and its Department of Environmental
20	Management; State of Wisconsin; Oklahoma Department of Environmental
į	



- 1 Quality; the State of Louisiana, on behalf of the Louisiana Department of
- 2 | Environmental Quality; Texas Commission on Environmental Quality; State of
- 3 Missouri, Department of Natural Resources; Washington State Department of
- 4 Ecology; Puget Sound Clean Air Agency, and San Joaquin Valley Unified Air
- 5 Pollution Control District with actual notice of the alleged violations, in
- 6 accordance with Section 113(a)(1) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(a)(1);

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

WHEREAS, the Complaints against SGCI allege that it made major modifications to certain major emitting facilities, without complying with the Non-attainment New Source Review (NNSR) and/or PSD requirements of the Act, by failing to obtain required permits, install required control technology, meet emission limits, and comply with requirements for monitoring, record-keeping and reporting, as specified in the Act;

WHEREAS, the Complaints state claims upon which relief can be granted against SGCI under Sections 113, 165, and 167 of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7413, 7475, and 7477, and 28 U.S.C. § 1355;

WHEREAS, SGCI has denied and continues to deny the violations alleged in the Complaints and NOV, and maintains that it has been and remains in compliance with the Act and is not liable for civil penalties or injunctive relief, and states that it is agreeing to the obligations imposed by this Consent Decree solely to avoid the costs and uncertainties of litigation and to improve the environment;

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. — 6

WHEREAS, EPA has selected glass manufacturing facilities (including	
container glass) as a national enforcement priority under the Clean Air Act's Ne	W
Source Review Program;	

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

WHEREAS, the United States and SGCI anticipate that this Consent Decree, including the installation and operation of pollution control technology and other measures adopted pursuant to this Consent Decree, will achieve significant reductions of emissions from the SGCI Facilities and thereby significantly improve air quality;

WHEREAS, all parties recognize that each Furnace is designed and Operated differently and may necessitate different limits for Sulfur Dioxide for each Furnace and each glass type;

WHEREAS, all parties recognize that glass Furnaces are Operated continuously for periods of five (5) to ten (10) years, and attempts to shut them down more frequently may result in significant problems including, but not limited to, damage to the refractory and safety concerns;

WHEREAS, SGCI has waived any applicable federal or state requirements of statutory notice of the alleged violations;

WHEREAS, the United States, Commonwealth of Massachusetts;

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Department of Environmental Protection; State of North Carolina; State of Illinois; State of Indiana and its Department of

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. - 7



Environmental Management; State of Wisconsin; Oklahoma Department of Environmental Quality; the State of Louisiana, on behalf of the Louisiana 2 Department of Environmental Quality; State of Missouri, Department of Natural 3 Resources; Washington State Department of Ecology; Puget Sound Clean Air Agency, and San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District, and SGCI, 5 have agreed, and the Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that this Consent 6 7 Decree has been negotiated in good faith and at arm's length; that this settlement is fair, reasonable, and in the public interest, and consistent with the goals of the Act; and that entry of this Consent Decree without further litigation is the most appropriate means of resolving this matter; 10 NOW, THEREFORE, without any admission by SGCI, and without 11 adjudication of the violations alleged in the Complaints or the NOV, it is hereby 12 ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows: 13 I. JURISDICTION AND VENUE 14

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1345, and 1355, and Section 113(b) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b), and over the Parties. Venue lies in this District pursuant to Section 113(b) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b), and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b) and (c) and 1395(a), because some of the violations alleged in the Complaints are alleged to

have occurred in, and SGCI conducts business in, this judicial district. SGCI

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. — 8

15

16

17

18

19

Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ Document 2-2 Filed 01/21/2010 Page 9 of 88

4

consents to this Court's jurisdiction over this Consent Decree and any action to enforce this Consent Decree, and to venue in this judicial district. For purposes of this Consent Decree and any action to enforce this Consent Decree, SGCI consents to this Court's jurisdiction over SGCI. Solely for the purposes of this Consent Decree and the underlying Complaints, and for no other purpose, SGCI waives all objections and defenses that it may have to the Court's jurisdiction over this action, to the Court's jurisdiction over SGCI, and to venue in this District. SGCI shall not challenge the terms of this Consent Decree or this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Decree. Except as expressly provided for herein, this Consent Decree shall not create any rights in or obligations of any party other than the Plaintiff, Plaintiff-Intervenors, and SGCI. Except as provided in Section XXIV (Public Comment) of this Consent Decree, the Parties consent to entry of this Consent Decree without further notice. 2. For purposes of this Consent Decree, SGCI agrees that the Complaints and the States' Complaints in Intervention state claims upon which relief may be granted pursuant to Sections 111 and 165 of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7411, 7475

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

20

and/or pursuant to state law.

Notice of the commencement of this action has been given to Massachusetts
 Department of Environmental Protection, New Jersey Department of

Environmental Protection, Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection,

- North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources, Illinois
- Environmental Protection Agency, State of Indiana and its Department of 2
- Environmental Management, Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources, Texas 3
- Commission on Environmental Quality, Oklahoma Department of Environmental 4
- Quality, Louisiana Department of Environmental Quality, Missouri Department of 5
- Natural Resources, California Air Resources Board, Washington State Department 6
- of Ecology, Puget Sound Clean Air Agency, San Joaquin Valley Unified Air 7
- Pollution Control District, and South Coast Air Quality Management District as
- required by Section 113(b) of the Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b).

#### II. APPLICABILITY

- 4. The obligations of this Consent Decree apply to and are binding upon the 11
- Plaintiff, Plaintiff-Intervenors and upon SGCI and its officers, employees, agents, 12
- subsidiaries, successors, assigns, or other entities or persons otherwise bound by 13
- law. 14

- SGCI shall be responsible for providing a copy of this Consent Decree to all 5. 15
- vendors, suppliers, consultants, contractors, agents, and any other company or 16
- organization retained to perform any of the work required by this Consent Decree. 17
- Notwithstanding any retention of contractors, subcontractors, or agents to perform 18
- any work required under this Consent Decree, SGCI shall be responsible for 19
- 20 ensuring that all work is performed in accordance with the requirements of this

- 1 | Consent Decree. For this reason, in any action to enforce this Consent Decree,
- 2 | SGCI shall not assert as a defense the failure of its officers, directors, employees,
- 3 servants, agents, or contractors to take actions necessary to comply with this
- 4 Consent Decree, unless SGCI establishes that such failure resulted from a Force
- 5 Majeure event, as defined in Paragraph 62 of this Consent Decree.

## III. DEFINITIONS

- 7 | 6. Terms used in this Consent Decree that are defined in the Act or in federal
- 8 regulations promulgated pursuant to the Act shall have the meanings assigned to
- 9 them in the Act or such regulations, unless otherwise provided in this Decree.
- 10 Whenever the terms set forth below are used in this Consent Decree, the following
- 11 definitions shall apply:

6

12

16

- a. "24-hour Block Average" shall be calculated by averaging the twenty-
- four (24) one-hour relevant data outputs (concentration or pounds) for a
- given Day and using the daily glass production rates (tons) on that Operating
- Day where applicable.
  - b. "Affected State(s)" shall mean any local agency Plaintiff-Intervenor
- or State Plaintiff-Intervenor and its agencies and political subdivisions
- having jurisdiction over a Facility addressed in this Consent Decree.
  - c. "Abnormally Low Production Rate" shall mean a glass production
- rate at or below the production rate set forth in Paragraph 10.

- d. "Abnormally Low Production Rate Day" shall mean any Operating
  Day where production falls into the range of Abnormally Low Production
  Rate, for at least one continuous hour.
  - e. "Calendar Year" shall mean the period commencing on January 1 and ending on December 31 of the same year.
  - f. "CEMS" means Continuous Emission Monitoring System.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

- g. "CEMS Certification" means the certification of the CEMS required by 40 C.F.R. § 60.13, 40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix B (Performance Specification 2) and 40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix F (Quality Assurance Procedures).
- h. "CEMS Certification Event" shall mean an event that triggers the requirement to complete a first or subsequent CEMS Certification. The first CEMS Certification shall not be required until the dates set forth in Table 8. Events that will trigger subsequent CEMS Certification include a Furnace Startup or a First Control Device Startup. SGCI shall commence such recertification no later than thirty (30) days after the Furnace Startup period concludes (but no later than seventy (70) Days after Furnace Startup commences) or First Control Device Startup period concludes. If a Furnace Startup and a First Control Device Startup happen at the same time, then the

- recertification shall not be conducted until the first Operating Day after the conclusion of the later startup event.
  - i. "Cloud Chamber Scrubber System" and "CCSS" shall mean a pollution control device that works by passing the Furnace exhaust gas stream through a chamber that contains a "scrubbing cloud" of high-density, charged water droplets. The droplets collect particles and sulfur oxides as they interact with the process gas stream. The droplets are then collected at the bottom of the system.
  - j. "Color Transition" shall mean the period of not more than seven Days from the time when a glass color of an oxidation state different from that previously melted in the Furnace, is introduced to the Furnace, to the time when saleable glass bottles are being produced in the new color.
  - k. "Complaints" shall mean the Complaints filed by the United States, and the Complaints filed by the Plaintiff-Intervenors in this action.
  - 1. "COMS" shall mean a Continuous Opacity Monitoring System.
  - m. "Consent Decree" or "Decree" shall mean this Consent Decree and all appendices attached hereto, but in the event of any conflict between the text of this Consent Decree and any Appendix, the text of this Consent Decree shall control.

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- n. "Continuous Operating Year" shall mean a Calendar Year during which, on every day of the year, at least one of the Furnaces connected to a control system is Operating.
  - o. "Control Device Startup" shall mean the period of time from commencement of operation of an SCR, Scrubber System, ESP, CCSS, or similar add-on control device until the operation of the device has been stabilized and the device has achieved normal operating conditions. Such period shall not exceed thirty (30) Days.
  - p. "Date of Entry" means the date this Consent Decree is approved or signed by the United States District Court Judge.
  - q. "Date of Lodging" means the date this Consent Decree is filed for lodging with the Clerk of the Court for the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington.
  - r. "Day" shall mean a calendar day unless expressly stated to be a working day or unless a State rule requires that CEMs data be reported on Standard time (with no change for Daylight Savings Time). In computing any period of time for determining reporting deadlines under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal or State holiday, in the State where the Facility is located, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18



- s. "EPA" or "the Agency" shall mean the United States Environmental
  Protection Agency and any of its successor departments or agencies.
  - t. "Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average" shall be expressed as pounds of pollutant per ton of glass produced calculated at the Furnace in question in accordance with the following formula and Subparagraphs i. and ii below:

$$30 - day \ average \ \frac{lb \ E}{ton} = \frac{COD_E \ (lbs) + P29D_E (lbs)}{COD_{Prod} \ (tons) + P29D_{prod} (tons)}$$

Where: 30-day average (lb E/ton) = The Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average E = Emissions of the pollutant in question (NO<sub>X</sub> or SO<sub>2</sub>)

> COD = Current Operating Day where the relevant Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average is the applicable limit.

 $COD_E$  = The daily Emissions as measured by a CEMS on the COD, in pounds.

 $COD_{Prod}$  = Daily glass production on the COD, in tons of glass.

P29D = The Previous 29 Operating Days where the relevant Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average is the applicable limit.

 $P29D_E$  = The sum of the daily  $NO_X$  or  $SO_2$  Emissions as measured by a CEMS during the P29D, in pounds.

 $P29D_{Prod}$  = The sum of the daily glass production during the P29D, in tons of glass.

25

1

1	i. A new Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average shall be
2	calculated for each new Operating Day where the Emission
3	Rate 30-day Rolling Average is the applicable standard.
4	Any Operating Day where the newly calculated Emission
5	Rate 30-day Rolling Average exceeds the limit is a separate
6	one Day violation; and
7	ii. As specified in this Consent Decree, some Operating Days
8	will be excluded from the Emission Rate 30-day Rolling
9	Average as set forth in Paragraphs 7-9 of this Consent
10	Decree.
11	u. "Emissions Credit(s)" means an authorization or credit to emit a
12	specified amount of the pollutants NO <sub>X</sub> , SO <sub>2</sub> , PM, PM <sub>10</sub> and PM <sub>2.5</sub> that is
13	allocated or issued under an emissions trading or marketable permit program
14	of any kind established under the Act or a State Implementation Plan.
15	v. "Facility" or "Facilities" shall mean SGCI's plants further described
16	below at Burlington, Wisconsin; Carteret, New Jersey; Dolton, Illinois;
17	Dunkirk, Indiana; Henderson, North Carolina; Lincoln, Illinois; Madera,
18	California; Milford, Massachusetts; Pevely, Missouri; Port Allegany,
19	Pennsylvania; Ruston, Louisiana; Sapulpa, Oklahoma; Seattle, Washington;



1	Waxahachie, Te	exas; and Wilson, North Carolina. Each of these plants may
2	be referred to as	a "Facility."
3	i.	"Burlington" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 815 S.
4	·	McHenry St, Burlington, Wisconsin;
5	ii.	"Carteret" shall mean SGCI's former Facility located at 50
6		Bryla St, Carteret, New Jersey;
7	iii.	"Dolton" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 13850
8		Cottage Grove Avenue, Dolton, Illinois;
9	iv.	"Dunkirk" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 524 E.
10		Center Street, Dunkirk, Indiana;
11	v.	"Henderson" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 620
12		Facet Road, Henderson, North Carolina;
13	vi.	"Lincoln" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 1200 North
14		Logan St., Lincoln, Illinois;
15	vii.	"Madera" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 24441
16		Avenue 12 & Road 24 1/2, Madera, California;
17	viii.	"Milford" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 1 National
18		St., Milford, Massachusetts;
19	ix.	"Pevely" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 1500 Saint-
20		Gobain Drive Hwy 61, Pevely, Missouri;
- 1		

1	x. "Port Allegany" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 1
2	Glass Place, Port Allegany, Pennsylvania;
3	xi. "Ruston" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 4241 Hwy
4	563, Ruston, Louisiana;
5	xii. "Sapulpa" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 1000 N.
6	Mission, Sapulpa, Oklahoma;
7	xiii. "Seattle" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 5801 E.
8	Marginal Way S., Seattle, Washington;
9	xiv. "Waxahachie" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 2400
10	I.H. 35 E., Waxahachie, Texas; and
11	xv. "Wilson" shall mean SGCI's Facility located at 2200
12	Firestone Boulevard, Wilson, North Carolina.
13	w. "First Control Device Startup" shall only refer to the first startup of
14	the relevant add-on control device (an SCR, Scrubber System, ESP, CCSS,
15	or similar add-on control). First Control Device Startup shall represent the
16	period of time from commencement of operation of the device until the
17	operation of the device has been stabilized and the device has achieved
18	normal operating conditions, but shall not exceed thirty (30) Days.
19	x. "Furnace" means for the purposes of NSPS only, a refractory vessel in
20	which raw materials are charged, melted at high temperature, refined, and

conditioned	to produce molten glass w	which includes foundations,	
superstructu	re and retaining walls, raw	w material charger systems, heat	
exchangers,	melter cooling system, ex	chaust system, refractory brick work,	
fuel supply a	and electrical boosting equ	uipment, integral control systems and	
instrumenta	tion, and appendages for co	conditioning and distributing molten	
glass to forn	ning apparatuses. For all o	other purposes, "Furnace" means a ur	iit
comprised o	of a refractory-lined vessel	in which raw materials are charged	
and melted a	at high temperature to prod	duce molten glass.	
y. "Furn	ace Startup" means the per	eriod of time while a Furnace's	
refractory is	being heated up from amb	bient temperature and includes the	
Initial Heati	ng Phase, Refractory Soak	c and Seal Phase, and Furnace	

- i. "Initial Heating Phase" means the slow heating of the

  Furnace refractory using portable natural-gas burners

  placed in the openings in the Furnace. This phase typically
  lasts no longer than four (4) Days and ends when the main

  Furnace burners commence operation.
- ii. "Refractory Soak and Seal Phase" means the phase of the Furnace Startup following the Initial Heating Phase when the Furnace is filled with molten glass, the temperature of

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

Stabilization Phase.

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	

20

the Furnace reaches operating conditions, and the refractory components reach thermal equilibrium. This phase typically lasts no longer than twenty-one (21) Days and ends when the joints between the refractory components are sealed and the Furnace is closed to the atmosphere.

iii. "Furnace Stabilization Phase" means the phase of Furnace Startup following the Refractory Soak and Seal Phase when the Furnace Operation is being stabilized. This phase will end no later than seventy (70) Days after the beginning of the Initial Heating Phase. However, notwithstanding the previous sentence, EPA or an Affected State may seek stipulated penalties if SGCI has unduly delayed completion of the Furnace Stabilization Phase. SGCI must track the status of the Startup as required in Exhibit A. Exhibit A includes conditions that may be used to indicate whether the Furnace Stabilization Phase should have been completed earlier than 70 days after the beginning of the Initial Heating Phase.

z. "Hot Spot Temperature" shall mean the highest temperature of the Furnace breastwall refractory. Breastwall refractory is the refractory

1	sidewall between the tuck stone (about 18" above glass line) and the crown
2	skew (where the Furnace crown meets the Furnace sidewall).
3	aa. "Inlet" shall be the emission concentration (in parts per million by
4	volume dry) measured prior to the control device.
5	bb. "Installation of Controls" shall, solely for the purpose of Paragraph 29
6	of this Consent Decree, include:
7	i. The installation of an OEAS, SCR, Semi-dry Scrubber
8	System, Dry Scrubber System, ESP, or CCSS;
9	ii. The installation of any alternative controls approved under
10	Paragraph 103;
11	iii. The conversion of a Furnace to Oxyfuel; and
12	iv. The receipt of a limit for a Furnace listed in Table 4 in
13	compliance with Paragraph 8.g., 9.f., 9.g., and 9.h.
14	cc. "Maintenance" shall mean activities necessary to keep the system or
15	equipment working in its normal operating condition as set forth in
16	Paragraph 13.
17	dd. "Major Rebuild" shall refer to the process of stopping glass
18	production, stopping the flow of fuel, fully cooling down a Furnace,
19	replacing some or all of the refractory in the Furnace, the crown and/or the
20	regenerators (if applicable), and beginning a new campaign by starting up

1	the Furnace again by firing fuel again and starting the production of glass. A			
2	Major Rebuild, for the purposes of this Consent Decree, does not include			
3	any refractory repairs conducted when the Furnace is still hot, emergency			
4	cold repairs, repairs solely required for restart of a Furnace which has			
5	temporarily ceased Operation due to economic reasons, or the planned minor			
6	cold repairs currently scheduled on the following Furnaces:			
7	i. Waxahachie;			
8	ii. Dolton Furnace #2;			
9	iii. Henderson Furnace #1;			
10	iv. Lincoln;			
11	v. Madera Furnace #1; and			
12	vi. Sapulpa Furnaces #50, #51, and #52.			
13	ee. "Malfunction" shall mean, consistent with 40 C.F.R. § 60.2, any			
14	sudden, infrequent, and not reasonably preventable failure of air pollution			
15	control equipment, process equipment, or a process to operate in a normal or			
16	usual manner, but shall not include failures that are caused in part by poor			
17	Maintenance or careless operation.			
18	ff. "Month" shall mean calendar month.			
19	gg. " $NO_X$ " shall mean the sum of oxides of nitrogen in the flue gas,			
20	collectively expressed as NO <sub>2</sub> .			

1	nn. "NSPS" shall mean the standards of performance for new stationary
2	sources codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 60. General NSPS requirements are
3	codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart A. NSPS requirements specifically
4	for glass manufacturing plants are codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subpart CC.
5	ii. "New Source Review" or "NSR" shall mean Prevention of Significant
6	Deterioration (PSD) and Nonattainment New Source Review (NNSR)
7	provisions in Part C and D of Subchapter I of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7470-
8	7492, 7501-7515, and federally-enforceable state implementation plans.
9	jj. "Operate," "Operation," "Operating" and "Operated" shall mean
10	when fuel is fired in the Furnace.
11	kk. "Operating Day" shall mean any Day where any fuel is fired into the
12	Furnace. The Day starts at 12:00 am and ends at 11:59 pm.
13	ll. "Outlet" shall mean the emission concentration (in parts per million
14	by volume dry) measured after a control device.
15	mm. "Outlet 30-day Rolling Average" is a term which applies only to SO <sub>2</sub>
16	and shall be calculated by determining the Outlet 24-hour Block Average
17	concentration from each Furnace (or combined stack, if applicable) during
18	an Operating Day and previous twenty-nine (29) Operating Days when
19	Outlet 30-day Rolling Average was the applicable standard. A new Outlet
20	30-day Rolling Average shall be calculated for each Operating Day. Any

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1	Operating Day where the newly calculated Outlet 30-day Rolling Average
2	exceeds the limit is a separate one Day violation. As specified in this
3	Consent Decree, the following Operating Days are exempt from this
4	average: Control Device Startup, Malfunction of the control device
5	(Scrubber System, CCSS, or ESP) and Maintenance on the control device
6	(Scrubber System, CCSS, or ESP).
7	nn. "Oxyfuel Furnace" shall mean a Furnace in which the gas that
8	provides the oxidant for combustion of the fuel is composed of greater than
9	or equal to 90 percent oxygen.
10	oo. "Oxygen Enriched Air Staging" and "OEAS" shall mean the method
11	of combustion air staging to control NO <sub>X</sub> formation by reducing the amount
12	of combustion air delivered to the firing ports, thereby decreasing the
13	oxygen available in the flame's high temperature zone in the first
14	combustion stage, and injecting oxygen-enriched air into the Furnace near
15	the exit port(s) to complete combustion in the second stage within the
16	Furnace.
17	pp. "Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by
18	an Arabic numeral.

1	qq. "Particulate Matter" and "PM" shall mean any finely divided solid or
2	liquid material, other than uncombined water, as measured by the reference
3	methods specified below:
4	i. Filterable Particulate is the particulate measured using EPA
5	Method 5 (40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A).
6	ii. Total particulate is the combination of filterable plus
7	condensable PM and is measured using Method 5 (40
8	C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A) and EPA Method 202: (40
9	C.F.R. Part 51 Appendix M).
10	rr. "Parties" shall mean the United States, Commonwealth of
11	Massachusetts, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, State of North Carolina,
12	State of Illinois, State of Indiana, State of Wisconsin, State of Washington,
13	Oklahoma Department of Environmental Quality, State of Louisiana, State
14	of Missouri, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District, Puget Sound
15	Clean Air Agency and SGCI.
16	ss. "Permit" shall include any and all final authorizations necessary (1) to
17	construct, modify, or Operate a Furnace; (2) to construct, install, and operate

a control device or monitoring device issued pursuant to federal, state, or

local law; or (3) to construct, install, and operate a control device or

monitoring device required by this Consent Decree.

18

19

1	tt. "Prevention of Significant Deterioration," and "PSD" shall mean the
2	attainment area New Source Review program within the meaning of Part C
3	of Subchapter I of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7470-7492.
4	uu. "Regenerative Furnace" shall mean a Furnace in which ambient air
5	provides the primary oxidant for combustion of the fuel and the air is
6	preheated using a system of regenerators to recover heat from the exhaust
7	gas.
8	vv. "Removal Efficiency" for SO <sub>2</sub> means the percent reduction in
9	concentration of that pollutant achieved by a Furnace's pollution control
10	device. This percent reduction shall be calculated by subtracting the Outlet
11	from the Inlet, dividing by the Inlet and then multiplying by 100.
12	ww. "Removal Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average" is a term which
13	applies to $SO_2$ emissions and shall be calculated by summing the Removal
14	Efficiency 24-hour Block Averages from each Furnace (or combined stack,
15	if applicable) for each Operating Day and previous twenty-nine (29)
16	Operating Days when Removal Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average was the
17	applicable standard and then dividing by 30. A new Removal Efficiency 30-

day Rolling Average shall be calculated for each new Operating Day. Any

Rolling Average is less than the Removal Efficiency limit is a separate one-

Operating Day where the newly calculated Removal Efficiency 30-day

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. — 26

18

19

1	day violation. As specified in this Consent Decree, the following Operating
2	Days are exempt from this average: Control Device Startup of the Scrubber
3	System, CCSS, or ESP; Malfunction of the Scrubber System, CCSS, or ESP;
4	and Maintenance on the Scrubber System, CCSS, or ESP.
5	xx. "Scrubber System" shall mean a type of system known sometimes as
6	a sorbent injection system which involves the addition of an alkaline
7	material into the gas stream to react with the acid gases. The acid gases
8	react with the alkaline sorbents to form solid salts.
9	i. Semi-dry Scrubber System – The system described above
10	with the sorbent in an aqueous phase which improves
11	collection efficiency.
12	ii. Dry Scrubber System – The system described above with
13	no moisture added in the reaction chamber or reaction area.
14	yy. "Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by a
15	Roman numeral.
16	zz. "Selective Catalytic Reduction" and "SCR" means a pollution control
17	device that reacts ammonia (NH <sub>3</sub> ) with the $NO_X$ to form nitrogen (N <sub>2</sub> ) and
18	water (H <sub>2</sub> O) using a catalyst to speed the reaction.
19	aaa. "SGCI" shall mean Saint-Gobain Containers, Inc.
20	bbb. "SO <sub>2</sub> " shall mean the pollutant sulfur dioxide.

1	ccc. "State" or "States" shall mean those States or Commonwealths and
2	local authorities that have jurisdiction over a Facility covered by this action.
3	ddd. "Supplemental Environmental Project" and "SEP" shall mean an
4	environmentally beneficial project that SGCI agrees to undertake pursuant to
5	this Consent Decree and SGCI is not otherwise legally required to perform.
6	eee. "System-wide Weighted Annual Average Actual Emissions" is a term
7	applicable to SO <sub>2</sub> emissions, expressed in pounds of SO <sub>2</sub> per ton of glass
8	produced (lbs/ton) and shall mean the total pounds of emissions of SO <sub>2</sub> as
9	measured by the continuous emissions monitoring systems (CEMS) emitted
10	in a Calendar Year from all Furnaces included in the average divided by the
11	total actual annual tons of glass production for all Furnaces included in the
12	average for that Calendar Year.
13	fff. "System-wide Weighted Average of Permit Limits" is a term
14	applicable to SO <sub>2</sub> emissions and shall be calculated by:
15	i. For each Furnace listed in Table 4, multiplying the
16	applicable permitted emission rate of SO <sub>2</sub> (in pounds per
17	ton of glass produced) by the maximum annual glass
18	production rate for each Furnace during Calendar Years
19	2009 through 2013. The permitted emission rate is the
20	federally-enforceable limit SGCI has requested and

1	obtained from the State for flint or colored glass as the case		
2	may be, in order to meet the requirements for the Furnaces		
3	listed in Table 4 identified in Paragraph 8.g.iii,		
4	ii. Summing the result of the equation in Subparagraph i.		
5	above for each Furnace listed in Table 4, and		
6	iii. Dividing the total of Subparagraph ii. above by the sum of		
7	all the maximum annual glass production rates for all		
8	Furnaces Listed in Table 4 from Subparagraph i. above.		
9	ggg. "Title V Permit" shall mean a permit required by or issued pursuant to		
10	the requirements of 42 U.S.C. § 7661 - 7661f.		
11	hhh. "Ton" or "tons" shall mean short ton or short tons (equal to 2000		
12	pounds).		
13	iii. "TSP" shall mean total suspended particulate.		
14	jjj. "United States" shall mean the United States of America, acting on		
15	behalf of EPA.		
16	IV. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF		
17	7. NO <sub>X</sub> Emission Controls, Limits, and Compliance Schedule		
18	a. Interim NO <sub>X</sub> Emission Limits:		
19	i. For those Furnaces listed in Table 1, the $NO_X$ emission		
20	limits in Table 1, expressed in tons of NO <sub>X</sub> per Calendar		

3

5

6

7

Year, shall apply and shall remain in place until installation of controls pursuant to Table 2 and issuance of a new Permit including the emission limits outlined in Paragraphs 7.c. through 7.e.

ii. For the Calendar Year 2009, and for each Calendar Year thereafter until Paragraph 7.b. applies, SGCI shall comply with the following annual interim NO<sub>X</sub> emission limits:

Table 1 – Interim NO<sub>X</sub> Emission Limits

Facility and	Interim NO <sub>X</sub>	Interim NO <sub>X</sub>
Furnace #	Emission Limit	Emission
	(tons per year)	Factor (lb/ton)
Dolton #2	316.8 tpy	6.2
Dolton #3	305.5 tpy	6.2
Henderson #2	457.7 tpy	7.6
Sapulpa #50	407.3 tpy	6.2
Seattle #3	176.8 tpy	3.8
Seattle #4	529 tpy	14.4
Dunkirk #1	146 tpy	1.6
Dunkirk #2	160.6 tpy	1.6
Lincoln	468.4 tpy	n/a

8

9

10

11

iii. Except for the Dolton Facility, prior to  $NO_X$  CEMS installation and certification, compliance with the interim  $NO_X$  emission limits in Table 1 shall be demonstrated by conducting an EPA Method 7E (40 C.F.R. Part 60



Appendix A) source test. Testing shall be conducted initially no later than twelve (12) months after the Date of Entry and once each Calendar Year thereafter until NO<sub>X</sub>

CEMS are installed and certified. A source test is not required the year that a NO<sub>X</sub> CEMS is installed.

Compliance with the annual ton per year interim limit in Table 1 shall be calculated by using the following equation:

$$NO_X = \left[\frac{PastTest \times 1stProd}{2000}\right] + \left[\frac{NewTest \times 2ndProd}{2000}\right]$$

Where:  $NO_X = NO_X$  Emissions (tpy)

PastTest = Last source test result (lb/ton). If no source test has been conducted pursuant to this Consent Decree, the Interim Emission Factor listed in Table 1 shall be used (lb/ton).

NewTest = New test from the year for which emissions are being calculated (lb/ton).

1stprod = Production from January 1<sup>st</sup> through the Day prior to the Day the new source test is commenced (tons of glass).

2ndprod = Production from the Day of the new source test through the end of that same Calendar Year (tons of glass).

Note: If SGCI elects to do more than one test in a year, emissions calculated on the Days following the second test, will be based on that second test.

22

23 24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	

- iv. For the Dolton Facility, emissions shall be calculated in the same way as above in Paragraph 7.a.iii, but testing shall be conducted initially no later than December 31, 2009, and then once again after December 31, 2010, but no later than December 31, 2011, for Furnaces #2 and #3. For the period of time in the Calendar Year 2009 before SGCI conducts the first source test under this Consent Decree, emissions shall be calculated based on the Interim Emission Factor listed in Table 1.
  - v. Upon NO<sub>X</sub> CEMS installation and certification as required by this Consent Decree, compliance with the interim NO<sub>X</sub> emission limit in Table 1 shall be demonstrated using emissions data generated by the NO<sub>X</sub> CEMS in order to calculate all subsequent daily emission rates that are used to calculate the annual emission rate for the Calendar Year. For the first Calendar Year during which CEMS are installed and certified, the annual emissions calculated will be the sum of the tons of NO<sub>X</sub> emitted on the Days when the emissions were determined from source test data (as calculated above in Paragraph 7.a.iii.) and the tons of NO<sub>X</sub>

2

3

4

5

emitted on the Days when emissions were determined by CEMS data.

- NO<sub>X</sub> Emission Controls and Compliance Schedule b.
  - i. For each Furnace in Table 2, SGCI shall operate the NO<sub>X</sub> emission control device specified for that Furnace in Table

2.

<u>Table 2 – NO<sub>X</sub> Emission Controls and Compliance Schedule</u>

Facility and	Controls Controls	Deadline
Furnace Number		
Pevely #21	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2009
Ruston #2	OEAS	December 31, 2009
Wilson #29	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2009
Port Allegany #1	OEAS	December 31, 2010
Ruston #1	OEAS	December 31, 2010
Milford #15	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2010
Milford #16	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2015
Wilson #28	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2011
Dunkirk #2	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2012
Seattle #4	OEAS	December 31, 2012
Waxahachie	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2013
Henderson #2	OEAS	December 31, 2013
Madera #1	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2014
Pevely #20	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2013
Dunkirk # 1	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2013
Port Allegany #3	OEAS	December 31, 2013
Dolton #1	SCR	December 31, 2014
Dolton #2	SCR	December 31, 2014
Dolton #3	SCR	December 31, 2014
Burlington #6	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2015
Burlington #7	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2015
Seattle #5	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2015
Seattle #3	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2016
Henderson #1	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2016

Seattle #2	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2017
Sapulpa #51	OEAS	December 31, 2018
Sapulpa #52	OEAS	December 31, 2018
Lincoln	Oxyfuel Furnace	December 31, 2018
Sapulpa #50	OEAS	December 31, 2018

- c. For Furnaces with Oxyfuel Technology:
  - After the next Major Rebuild, but no later than the dates specified in Table 2, SGCI shall only Operate the Furnace using Oxyfuel technology.
  - ii. SGCI shall install, maintain and Operate the Oxyfuel

    Furnace such that the gas that provides the oxidant for

    combustion of the fuel is at least 90 percent oxygen.
  - iii. SGCI shall comply with the following applicable limits for Oxyfuel Furnaces:
    - Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average Limit –
      Commencing on the first Operating Day after
      completion of the Furnace Startup period and
      CEMS Certification (where the CEMS has been
      installed), but no later than the date specified in
      Table 2, an Oxyfuel Furnace shall not exceed the
      Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average of 1.3
      pounds of NO<sub>X</sub> per ton of glass produced, as

16

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

4

measured using a NO<sub>X</sub> CEMS (where available),
except during the following periods (as set forth in
this Subparagraph): Abnormally Low Production
Rate Days; Furnace Startup; Malfunction of the
Furnace; and Maintenance of the Furnace.

2. NO<sub>X</sub> Limit during Abnormally Low Production Rate Days –For any Abnormally Low Production Rate Day SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions generated during that Day from the Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average. During these Days, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the following pound per day limit:

$$NO_{X Oxy Abn} = 1.3 \frac{lb NO_X}{ton} \times \left[ \frac{P}{0.35} \right]$$

Where:  $NO_{X Oxy Abn} = NO_{X}$  emission limit for an Oxyfuel Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day. P = Furnace-specific production threshold as defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass produced per day.

3. Limits during Furnace Startup –

Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ Document 2-2 Filed 01/21/2010 Page 36 of 88



1	a. Initial Heating Phase Operational Limit:
2	SGCI shall burn no more than 5.0 million
3	standard cubic feet of natural gas in that
4	Furnace during the Initial Heating Phase of
5	the Furnace Startup.
6	b. Refractory Soak and Seal Phase Operational
7	Limits: SGCI shall comply with the
8	following operational limits to limit $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{X}}$
9	emissions during the Refractory Soak and
10	Seal Phase of the Furnace Startup:
11	i. Burn no more than sixty million
12	standard cubic feet natural gas in that
13	Furnace;
14	ii. Limit excess oxygen below 5 percent
15	at the Furnace exhaust flue, as
16	determined by handheld monitor, once
17	per shift;
18	iii. Limit Hot Spot Temperature to 2900
19	degrees F; and

Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ Document 2-2 Filed 01/21/2010 Page 37 of 88



1	iv. Use thermal blankets or similar
2	techniques to minimize air infiltration
3	until expansion joints are sufficiently
4	closed.
5	c. Furnace Stabilization Phase Operational
6	Limits: SGCI shall comply with the
7	following operational limits to limit $NO_X$
8	emissions during the Furnace Stabilization
9	Phase of the Furnace Startup:
10	i. Burn no more than ninety million
11	standard cubic feet natural gas in that
12	Furnace;
13	ii. Limit excess oxygen below 5 percent
14	at the Furnace exhaust flue as
15	determined by handheld monitor, once
16	per shift; and
17	iii. Limit Hot Spot Temperature to 2900
18	degrees F.
19	4. NO <sub>X</sub> limit during Malfunction of the Furnace – For
20	any Operating Day where a Malfunction of the

1	Furnace occurs for any period of time, SGCI may
2	elect to exclude the emissions generated during that
3	Operating Day (Operating Days if the event covers
4	more than one Operating Day) from the Emission
5	Rate 30-day Rolling Average. During the
6	Malfunction Days excluded from the Emission Rate
7	30-day Rolling Average, a CEMS shall be used to
8	demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block
9	Average with the following pound per day limit:
10	$NO_{XOxyMalf} = 4 \times NO_{XOxyAbn}$
11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Where: $NO_{X \text{ Oxy Malf}} = NO_{X}$ emission limit for an Oxyfuel Furnace during a Malfunction Day, in pounds per day. $NO_{X \text{ Oxy Abn}} = As$ defined in Paragraph 7.c.iii.2, $NO_{X}$ emission limit for an Oxyfuel Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day.
18	5. NO <sub>X</sub> limit during Maintenance of the Furnace – For
19	any Operating Day where Maintenance activities on
20	the Furnace are performed, SGCI may elect to
21	exclude the Maintenance Day from the Emission
22	Rate 30-day Rolling Average. For any
23	Maintenance Day which is excluded from the 30-



1	day rolling average, a CEMS shall be used to
2	demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block
3	Average with the following pound per day limit:
4	$NO_{X\ Oxy\ Maint} = rac{MH  imes [4  imes NO_{X\ Oxy\ Abn}]}{24} + rac{NH  imes [NO_{X\ Oxy\ Abn}]}{24}$
5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Where: $NO_{X \text{ Oxy Maint}} = NO_{X}$ emission limit for an Oxyfuel Furnace during a Maintenance Day, in pounds per day. $NO_{X \text{ Oxy Abn}} = As$ defined in Paragraph 7.c.iii.2, $NO_{X}$ emission limit for an Oxyfuel Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day. $MH = Hours$ of Maintenance
13	NH = Normal Hours = 24 - MH
14	d. For Furnaces with Selective Catalytic Reduction (SCR):
15	i. For the Dolton Facility, no later than the first Operating
16	Day after the date specified in Table 2, SGCI must
17	commence operation of SCR to control emissions from all
18	three Furnaces. For all other Furnaces, no later than the
19	first Operating Day after the conclusion of the Control
20	Device Startup period, SGCI shall Operate the Furnace(s)
21	passing all stack gases (except during up to the first seven
22	(7) days of the Furnace Startup; during Malfunction of the
23	SCR or Scrubber System/ESP; or during Maintenance of
24	the SCR or Scrubber System/ESP) through a Selective

1	Catalytic Reduction device in compliance with the
2	following:
3	1. This SCR must be designed for a removal
4	efficiency of at least 90 percent; and
5	2. When the SCR is operating, SGCI shall
6	continuously operate the SCR according to the
7	vendor recommendations in order to minimize
8	emissions to the extent practicable taking into
9	consideration ammonia slip.
10	ii. SGCI shall comply with the following applicable $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{X}}$
11	limits for all Furnaces to be equipped with SCR:
12	1. Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average Limit –
13	Commencing on the first Operating Day after
14	completion of the Control Device Startup and
15	CEMS Certification, but no later than the date
16	specified in Table 2, SGCI shall not emit more than
17	1.3 pounds of $NO_X$ per ton of glass produced on a
18	30-day rolling average, as measured using a $NO_X$
19	CEMS (where available), except during the
20	following periods (as set forth in this

1 Subparagraph): Abnormally Low Production Rate 2 Days for any of the Furnaces; Control Device 3 Startup; up to the first seven (7) days of the Furnace Startup; Malfunction of the SCR or Scrubber 4 System/ESP; and Maintenance of the SCR or 5 Scrubber System/ESP; 6 2. NO<sub>X</sub> Limit during Abnormally Low Production 7 8 Rate Days – When any of the Furnace(s) ducted through an SCR is Operating at an Abnormally 9 10 Low Production Rate, SGCI may elect to exclude emissions from all Furnaces connected to the SCR 11 from the Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average. 12 13 During these Days, a CEMS shall be used to 14 demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block 15 Average with the following pound per day limit:  $NO_{XSCRAbn} = 1.3 \frac{lb NO_X}{ton} \times \left[ \frac{P}{0.35} \right]$ 16 Where: 17  $NO_{X SCR Abn} = NO_{X}$  emission limit for SCR during an Abnormally Low Production Rate 18 19 Day on any of the Furnaces ducted through the SCR, in pounds per day 20

21

22

P = Sum of the Furnace-specific production

thresholds as defined in Paragraph 10, in

1 2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	

18

19

20

tons of glass produced per day for all of the Furnaces ducted through the SCR.

- 3. The first seven (7) days of the Furnace Startup —
  For no more than the first seven (7) Days of the
  Furnace Startup, the Furnace exhaust may bypass
  the SCR to avoid having the operating inlet
  temperature of the SCR fall below its operational
  range. During these bypass Days SGCI shall burn
  no more than 15.0 million standard cubic feet of
  natural gas in that Furnace;
- 4. NO<sub>X</sub> limit during Startup of the SCR and Malfunction of the SCR or Scrubber System/ESP For any Operating Day during the Startup of SCR or where a Malfunction of the SCR or Scrubber System/ESP occurs for any period of time, SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions generated during that Operating Day (or Operating Days if the event covers more than one Operating Day) from the Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average. During the Malfunction Days excluded from the Emission



1	Rate 30-day Rolling Average, a CEMS shall be
2	used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block
3	Average with the following pound per day limit:
4	$NO_{XSCR\ Malf,SCR\ Startup} = 5 \times NO_{XSCR\ Abn}$
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Where:  NO <sub>X SCR Malf, SCR Startup</sub> = NO <sub>X</sub> emission limit for a Furnace using SCR during a Malfunction Day and during SCR Startup, in pounds per day.  NO <sub>X SCR Abn</sub> = As defined in 7.d.ii.2, NO <sub>X</sub> emission limit for SCR during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day.
13	5. NO <sub>X</sub> limit during Maintenance of the SCR or
14	Scrubber System/ESP – For any Operating Day
15	where Maintenance activities on the SCR or
16	Scrubber System/ESP are performed, SGCI may
17	elect to exclude the Maintenance Day from the
18	Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average. For any
19	Day which is excluded from the 30-day rolling
20	average, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate
21	compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the
22	following pound per day limit:
23	$NO_{XSCRMaint} = \frac{MH \times [5 \times NO_{XSCRAbn}]}{24} + \frac{NH \times [NO_{XSCRAbn}]}{24}$

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Where: $NO_{X \text{ SCR Maint}} = NO_{X}$ emission limit for a Furnace using SCR during a Maintenance Day, in pounds per day $NO_{X \text{ SCR Abn}} = As$ defined in 7.d.ii.2, $NO_{X}$ emission limit for a Furnace using SCR during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day $MH = Hours$ of Maintenance $NH = Normal Hours = 24 - MH$
10	e. For Furnaces with OEAS as identified in Table 2
11	i. Except for the Sapulpa Furnaces, at the end of the Furnace
12	Startup period following the next Major Rebuild, but no
13	later than the first Operating Day after the dates specified in
14	Table 2, SGCI shall only Operate the designated Furnace
15	using OEAS technology.
L6	ii. For the Sapulpa Furnaces, no later than the first Operating
L7	Day after the date specified in Table 2, SGCI shall only
18	Operate the Furnaces using OEAS technology.
19	iii. SGCI shall comply with the following applicable NO <sub>X</sub>
20	limits for OEAS-equipped Furnaces:
21	1. Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average Limit –
22	Commencing on the first Operating Day after
23	completion of the Furnace Startup and CEMS
24	Certification (where a CEMS is available), but no
1	

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
9 110 111 12 13	
11	
12	
13	
15	
16	
17	
18	

later than the date specified in Table 2, SGCI shall not emit more than 3.8 pounds of NO<sub>X</sub> per ton of glass produced on a 30-day Rolling Average (except for the Seattle Furnace #4 and Henderson Furnace #2, which shall achieve an Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average equal to 0.6 multiplied by the result of the last stack test (in pounds per ton) prior to installing OEAS), as measured using a NO<sub>X</sub> CEMS (where available), except during the following periods (as set forth in this Subparagraph): Abnormally Low Production Rate Days; Furnace Startup; Malfunction of the Furnace; and Maintenance of the Furnace.

2. NO<sub>X</sub> Limit during Abnormally Low Production
Rate Days – For any Abnormally Low Production
Rate Day SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions
generated during that Day from the Emission Rate
30-day Rolling Average. During these Days, a
CEMS shall be used to demonstrate compliance on

Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ

16

17

18

19

20

21

Document 2-2

Filed 01/21/2010

Page 46 of 88

4

a 24-hour Block Average with the following pound 2 per day limit:  $NO_{X OEAS Abn} = 3.8 \frac{lb NO_X}{ton} \times \left[ \frac{P}{0.35} \right]$ 3 4 Where: NO<sub>X OEAS Abn</sub>= NO<sub>X</sub> emission limit for an OEAS-Equipped Furnace during an 5 Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in 7 pounds per day. P = Furnace-specific production threshold as 8 9 defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass 10 produced per day. 3. Limits during Furnace Startup – 11 12 a. Initial Heating Phase Operational Limit: 13 SGCI shall burn no more than 5.0 million standard cubic feet of natural gas in that 14 15 Furnace during the Initial Heating Phase of

b. Refractory Soak and Seal Phase Operational
Limits: SGCI shall comply with the
following operational limits to limit NO<sub>X</sub>
emissions during the Refractory Soak and
Seal Phase of the Furnace Startup:

the Furnace Startup.



1	i. Burn no more than sixty million
2	standard cubic feet natural gas in that
3	Furnace;
4	ii. Limit excess oxygen below 5 percent
5	at the Furnace exhaust flue, as
6	determined by handheld monitor, once
7	per shift;
8	iii. Limit Hot Spot Temperature to 2900
9	degrees F; and
10	iv. Use thermal blankets or similar
11	techniques to minimize air infiltration
12	until expansion joints are sufficiently
13	closed.
14	c. Furnace Stabilization Phase Operational
15	Limits: SGCI shall comply with the
16	following operational limits to limit NO <sub>X</sub>
17	emissions during the Furnace Stabilization
18	Phase of the Furnace Startup:

1	i. Burn no more than ninety million
2	standard cubic feet natural gas in that
3	Furnace;
4	ii. Limit excess oxygen below 5 percent
5	at the Furnace exhaust flue as
6	determined by handheld monitor, once
7	per shift; and
8	iii. Limit Hot Spot Temperature to 2900
9	degrees F.
10	4. NO <sub>X</sub> limit during Malfunction – For any Operating
11	Day where a Malfunction of the Furnace occurs for
12	any period of time, SGCI may elect to exclude the
13	emissions generated during those Operating Day
14	(Operating Days if the event covers more than one
15	Operating Day) from the Emission Rate 30-day
16	Rolling Average. During the Malfunction Days
17	excluded from the Emission Rate 30-day Rolling
18	Average, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate
19	compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the
20	following pound per day limit:

1	$NO_{XOEASMalf} = 3 \times NO_{XOEASAbn}$
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Where: $NO_{X \text{ OEAS Malf}} = NO_{X}$ emission limit for an OEAS-Equipped Furnace during a Malfunction Day, in pounds per day $NO_{X \text{ OEAS Abn}} = As$ defined under Paragraph 7.e.iii.2, $NO_{X}$ emission limit for an OEAS-Equipped Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per
9	day.
10	5. NO <sub>X</sub> limit during Maintenance – For any Operating
11	Day where Maintenance activities on the Furnace
12	are performed, SGCI may elect to exclude the
13	Maintenance Day from the Emission Rate 30-day
14	Rolling Average. For any Maintenance Day which
15	is excluded from the 30-day Rolling Average, a
16	CEMS shall be used to demonstrate compliance on
17	a 24-hour Block Average with the following pound
18	per day limit:
19	$NO_{X OEAS Maint} = \frac{MH \times [3 \times NO_{X OEAS Abn}]}{24} + \frac{NH \times [NO_{X OEAS Abn}]}{24}$
20 21 22 23 24 25 26	Where: $NO_{X \text{ OEAS Maint}} = NO_{X}$ emission limit for an OEAS-Equipped Furnace during a Maintenance Day, in pounds per day $NO_{X \text{ OEAS Abn}} = As$ defined in 7.e.iii.2., $NO_{X}$ emission limit for an OEAS-Equipped Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day

	MH = Hours of Maintenance
į	NH = Normal Hours = 24 - MH

- f. Monitoring: A CEMS, if available, shall be used to demonstrate compliance with the NO<sub>X</sub> limits in Paragraph 7.c. through 7.e.. If the Facility does not have a CEMS when it is required to meet the limit in Paragraphs 7.c. through 7.e. above, compliance shall be demonstrated using data generated from annual stack tests complying with 40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A Method 7E. If a CEMS Certification Event occurs, then the requirement to demonstrate compliance continuously with the limit for that Furnace will be suspended until Certification is completed (provided the seven-day test required for Certification is commenced the first Operating Day following the conclusion of the CEMS Certification Event).
- g. Existing State/Local Limits: The limits in Paragraph 7 do not replace any current State/local limits and do not relieve SGCI of its obligation to comply with those limits.
- h. Recordkeeping: For any Operating Day that SGCI is excluding emissions from the relevant Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average, it shall record the date, the exception (Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, Furnace Startup, Control Device Startup, Malfunction, or Maintenance) under which it is excluded, a calculation of the applicable limit (pounds per

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ Document 2-2 Filed 01/21/2010 Page 51 of 88



1	day) according to the equations above, and the recorded emissions according
2	to the CEMS (pounds per day). For any Operating Day excluded for
3	Maintenance, SGCI shall record the total number of hours during which
4	Maintenance occurred.
5	i. Recordkeeping and Reporting during Furnace Startup: In addition to
6	the record keeping in Subparagraph h. above, during the applicable Furnace
7	Startup period phases SGCI must also keep the following records:
8	i. For the Initial Heating Phase —
9	1. Total natural gas usage in that Furnace (in million
10	standard cubic feet)
11	ii. For the Refractory Soak and Seal Phase –
12	1. Total natural gas usage in that Furnace (in million
13	standard cubic feet);
14	2. Excess oxygen percentage at the Furnace exhaust
15	flue (as determined by handheld monitor once per
16	shift);
17	3. Hot Spot Temperature (measured once per shift);
18	and

1	4. A certified statement asserting whether thermal
2	blankets or similar techniques were used during this
3	period.
4	iii. For the Furnace Stabilization Phase –
5	1. Total natural gas usage in that Furnace (in million
6	standard cubic feet);
7	2. Excess oxygen percentage at the Furnace exhaust
8	flue (as determined by handheld monitor once per
9	shift); and
10	3. Average Hot Spot Temperature (measured once per
11	shift).
12	j. Where a Facility has more than one Furnace subject to the same
13	emission limit (e.g., 1.3 lb/ton for Oxyfuel or 3.8 lb/ton for OEAS)
14	compliance with the 30-day rolling limits set forth herein may be determined
15	by averaging the emissions from all Furnaces subject to the same emission
16	limit at a given facility.
17	k. Where a Facility has more than one Furnace routed through the same
18	stack, but the Furnaces are not subject to the same emission limit,
19	compliance shall be demonstrated using CEMS measuring each Furnace

exhaust prior to the combination of the Furnace exhaust. However, if the

exhaust system configuration prevents SGCI from installing a CEMS in each
Furnace individually, compliance may be demonstrated by measuring the
exhaust from one Furnace prior to the combined exhaust and measuring the
total emissions after the stacks are combined (which will be used to
determine emissions from the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Furnace by subtracting the first Furnace's
emission rate from the common exhaust emission rate).

l. No later than one year after the installation of Oxyfuel technology on Furnace #16 at Milford, SGCI shall install a Heat Recovery System at the Milford Facility. The System shall be designed to reduce or eliminate the energy demand of the Facility from external sources. SGCI must apply for a plan approval under 310 C.M.R. 7.02, if required by law, for this system twelve (12) months prior to the installation and comply with any monitoring, record keeping, and/or reporting required by law. This system must be constructed and operated in compliance with all applicable Federal and State laws.

## 8. SO<sub>2</sub> Emission Controls, Limits, and Compliance Schedule

- a. Interim SO<sub>2</sub> Emission Limit:
  - i. On and after the first stack test following the Date of Entry (and on and after thirty (30) Days after the Date of Entry for a Furnace which has a certified SO<sub>2</sub> CEMS on the Date of

20

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

Entry), all SGCI Furnaces listed in Table 3 belo		Entry), all SGCI Furnaces listed in Table 3 below shall
2		meet an interim limit of 2.5 pounds of SO <sub>2</sub> per ton of glass
3		produced except during periods of Abnormally Low
4		Production Rate Days, Furnace Startup, Malfunction,
5		Maintenance, and Color Transition. This interim limit shall
6		remain in effect until the Furnace is required to comply
7		with an SO <sub>2</sub> emission limit specified in Paragraph 8
8		Subsections 8.c. through e. and g.
9	ii.	Except for the Dolton Facility, prior to SO <sub>2</sub> CEMS
10		installation and Certification, compliance with the interim
11		SO <sub>2</sub> emission limit shall be demonstrated by conducting an
12		EPA Method 6C (40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A) source
13		test. Testing shall be conducted initially no later than
14		twelve (12) months after the Date of Entry and once each
15		Calendar Year thereafter until SO <sub>2</sub> CEMS are installed and
16		certified. A source test is not required the year that a SO <sub>2</sub>
17		CEMS is installed.
18	iii.	Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average Limit – Upon SO <sub>2</sub>
19		CEMS installation and Certification, SGCI shall not emit
20		more than 2.5 pounds of SO <sub>2</sub> per ton of glass produced on a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

- 30-day Rolling Average, as measured using an SO<sub>2</sub> CEMS, except during the following periods (as set forth in this Subparagraph): Abnormally Low Production Rate Days; Furnace Startup; Malfunction of the Furnace; Color Transition; and Maintenance of the Furnace.
  - 1. SO<sub>2</sub> Limit during Abnormally Low Production Rate

    Days For any Abnormally Low Production Rate

    Day SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions

    generated during that Day from the Emission Rate

    30-day Rolling Average when any Furnace, or any

    one of the Furnaces that is ducted through the same

    exhaust stack, is Operating at an Abnormally Low

    Production Rate. During these Days, a CEMS shall

    be used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour

    Block Average with the following pound per day

    limit for the Furnace(s) operating at Abnormally

    Low Production Rate.

$$SO_{2 Interim Abn} = 2.5 \frac{lb SO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]$$

Where:

SO<sub>2 Interim Abn</sub> = SO<sub>2</sub> interim emission limit for a Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day.

H

1 2 3	P = Furnace-specific production threshold as defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass produced per day.
4	2. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Furnace Startup –SGCI shall
5	comply with the following operational limit to limit
6	SO <sub>2</sub> emissions during all phases of Furnace Startup:
7	a. During the startup period, SGCI will limit the
8	amount of sulfur added to the batch materials
9	to 2.6 pounds per ton of total batch material
10	(including cullet) or less.
11	3. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Malfunction – For any Operating
12	Day where a Malfunction of the Furnace occurs for
13	any period of time, SGCI may elect to exclude the
14	emissions generated during that Operating Day (or
15	Operating Days if the event covers more than one
L6	Operating Day) from the Emission Rate 30-day
L7	Rolling Average when any Furnace, or any one of
18	the Furnaces that is ducted through the same
L9	exhaust stack, has a Malfunction. During the
20	Malfunction Days excluded from the Emission Rate
21	30-day Rolling Average, a CEMS shall be used to



1 demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block 2 Average with the following pound per day limit for 3 the Malfunctioning Furnace(s):  $SO_{2 Interim Malf} = 3 \times SO_{2 Interim Abn}$ 4 Where: SO<sub>2 Interim Malf</sub> = SO<sub>2</sub> interim emission limit 5 6 for a Furnace during a Malfunction Day, in 7 pounds per day. 8 SO<sub>2 Interim Abn</sub> = As defined in Paragraph 8.a.iii.1, SO<sub>2</sub> interim emission limit for a 9 10 Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day. 11 12 4. SO<sub>2</sub> limit during Maintenance – For any Operating Day where Maintenance activities on the Furnace 13 14 are performed, SGCI may elect to exclude the Maintenance Day from the Emission Rate 30-day 15 16 Rolling Average when any Furnace, or any one of 17 the Furnaces that is ducted through the same exhaust stack, undergoes Maintenance. For any 18 Day which is excluded from the 30-day rolling 19 20 average, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate 21 compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the 22 following pound per day limit for the Furnace(s) undergoing Maintenance: 23



1	$SO_{2\ Interim\ Maint} = \frac{MH \times [3 \times SO_{2\ Interim\ Abn}]}{24} + \frac{NH \times [SO_{2\ Interim\ Abn}]}{24}$
2 3 4	Where: $SO_{2 \text{ Interim Maint}} = SO_{2}$ interim emission limit for a Furnace during a Maintenance Day, in pounds per day.
5 6 7 8	SO <sub>2 Interim Abn</sub> = As defined in Paragraph 8.a.iii.1, SO <sub>2</sub> interim emission limit for a Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day.
9 10	MH = Hours of Maintenance NH = Normal Hours = 24 – MH
11	5. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Color Transition – For any
12	Operating Days during which a Color Transition is
13	occurring SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions
14	on such Days from the Emission Rate 30-day
15	Rolling Average when any Furnace, or any one of
16	the Furnaces that is ducted through the same
17	exhaust stack, has a Color Transition. During these
18	Days, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate
19	compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the
20	following pound per day limit for the Furnace(s)
21	having a Color Transition:
22	$SO_{2\ Interim\ Col\ Tran} = 2 \times SO_{2\ Interim\ Abn}$
23 24 25	Where: $SO_{2 \text{ Interim Col Tran}} = SO_{2}$ interim emission limit for a Furnace during a Color Transition, in pounds per day.

ge

SO<sub>2 Interim Abn</sub> = As defined in Paragraph 8.a.iii.1, SO<sub>2</sub> interim emission limit for a Furnace during an Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day.

- iv. At Facilities with more than one Furnace subject to an interim limit, compliance may be determined by averaging the emissions from all such Furnaces at a given Facility.
- v. When one or more Furnace(s) Operating under normal conditions are ducted through the same exhaust stack as one or more Furnace(s) that are Operating at an Abnormally Low Production Rate, has a Malfunction, undergoes Maintenance, or has a Color Transition, the combined daily emission limit for the Furnaces shall be the sum of the following SO<sub>2</sub> Normal Lb/day limit for the normally Operating Furnace(s) and the relevant limit set forth in Paragraph 8(a)(iii)(1), (3), (4), or (5) for the remaining Furnace(s).

$$SO_{2 \, Normal \, lb/day} = 2.5 \frac{lb \, SO_2}{ton} \times ADP$$

Where:

 $SO_{2 \text{ Normal lb/day}} = SO_2$  interim emission limit for a normally Operating Furnace during a day where a commonly ducted furnace is experiencing an event a set forth in Paragraph 8(a)(iii)(1), (3), (4), or (5).

22 23

19

20

ADP = Actual Daily Production for the normally Operating Furnace.

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

vi. For the Dolton Facility, prior to SO<sub>2</sub> CEMS installation and Certification, compliance with the interim SO<sub>2</sub> emission limit shall be demonstrated by conducting an EPA Method 6C (40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A) source test. Testing shall be conducted initially no later than December 31, 2009, and then once again after December 31, 2010, but no later than December 31, 2011, for all three Furnaces.

b. SO<sub>2</sub> Emission Controls and Compliance Schedule

 i. SGCI shall operate one of the SO<sub>2</sub> emission control devices specified for that Furnace in Table 3.

<u>Table 3 – SO<sub>2</sub> Emission Controls and Compliance Schedule</u>

Facility	Controls	<u>Deadline</u>
Seattle #5	CCSS – See Section 8.f.	See Section 8.f.
Milford #15 & #16	Semi-dry Scrubber or CCSS – See	December 31, 2015
	Section 8.c. or 8.e.	
Dunkirk #1 & #2	Semi-dry Scrubber or CCSS – See	December 31, 2012
	Section 8.c. or 8.e.	
Waxahachie	Semi-dry Scrubber or CCSS – See	December 31, 2013
	Section 8.c. or 8.e.	
Pevely #20 & #21	Semi-dry Scrubber or CCSS – See	December 31, 2013
•	Section 8.c. or 8.e.	
Dolton #1, #2, & #3	Dry Scrubber – See Section 8.d.	December 31, 2014
Port Allegany #1 & #3	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Henderson #1	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Henderson #2	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. — 60

UNITED STATES ATTORNEY
5220 UNITED STATES COURTHOUSE
700 STEWART STREET
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-1271
(206) 553-7970



Lincoln	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Burlington #6	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Burlington #7	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Sapulpa #50	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Sapulpa #51	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Sapulpa #52	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Ruston #1	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Ruston #2	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Seattle #2	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Seattle #3	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Seattle #4	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Wilson #28	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.
Wilson #29	Process controls – See Section 8.g.	See Section 8.g.

c. For Furnaces with Semi-dry Scrubbers

i. After the next Major Rebuild (except Milford Furnace #15 and Pevely Furnace #21), but no later than the first
 Operating Day after the dates specified in Table 3, SGCI shall Operate the Furnace passing all stack gases through a Semi-dry Scrubber except during periods of Control Device
 Startup, up to the first seven (7) days of the Furnace
 Startup, and during Malfunction of the Scrubber System or
 ESP and Maintenance on the Scrubber System or ESP.

5 6

1

2

3

7

9

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC.  $\,-\,61$ 

Page 62 of 88

ii. SGCI shall comply with the following applicable SO <sub>2</sub>		
for Furnaces with Semi-dry Scrubbers:		
3	1. SO <sub>2</sub> 30-day rolling average limit – Commencing on	
4	the first Operating Day after completion of the	
5	Control Device Startup and CEMS Certification,	
6	but no later than the date specified in Table 3, a	
7	Furnace equipped with a Semi-dry Scrubber shall	
8	comply with the following limits as measured using	
9	an SO <sub>2</sub> CEMS, except during the following periods	
10	(as set forth in this Subparagraph): Control Device	
11	Startup, Furnace Startup, Malfunction of the	
12	Scrubber System or ESP, and Maintenance of the	
13	Scrubber System or ESP.	
14	a. No dilution air will be intentionally added to	
15	the stack gases between the Scrubber System	
16	and the CEMS. When determining	
17	compliance with all Scrubber System limits,	
18	there shall be no oxygen correction, as per	
19	vendor guarantee.	

ge.

1		SGCI shall determine a daily Inlet 24-hour
2		Block Average. The 30-day rolling average
3		compliance limit for each Operating Day wil
4		depend on the daily Inlet 24-hour Block
5		Average and will either be as defined in
6		8.c.ii.1.c. or 8.c.ii.1.d., but not both.
7	c.	If the average daily Inlet calculated in
8		8.c.ii.1.b. is equal to or greater than 300 parts
9		per million by volume dry (ppmvd) then the
10		Removal Efficiency on a 24-hour Block
11		Average for that Day and a Removal
12		Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average shall be
13		calculated. SGCI must operate the Semi-dry
14		Scrubber such that the Removal Efficiency
15		30-day Rolling Average is greater than or
16		equal to 85 percent.
17	d.	If the average daily Inlet calculated in
18		8.c.ii.1.b. is less than 300 ppmvd, then the
19		Scrubber Outlet 24-hour Block Average
20		concentration for that Day and Scrubber

Outlet 30-day Rolling Average shall be		
2	calculated. SGCI must operate the Semi-dry	
3	Scrubber such that the Scrubber Outlet 30-	
4	day Rolling Average is less than or equal to	
5	45 ppmvd.	
6	2. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Control Device Startup or up to	
7	the first Seven (7) Days of Furnace Startup –SGCI	
8	shall comply with the following operational limit to	
9	limit SO <sub>2</sub> emissions during all phases of Control	
10	Device Startup or Furnace Startup:	
11	a. During the startup period, SGCI will limit the	
12	amount of sulfur added to the batch materials	
13	to 2.6 pounds per ton of total batch material	
14	(including cullet) or less.	
15	b. During no more than the first seven (7) Days	
16	of Furnace Startup, the Furnace exhaust may	
17	bypass the Scrubber System to avoid having	
18	the operating inlet temperature of the	
19	Scrubber System fall below its operational	
20	range. During these bypass Days, SGCI shall	

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21



burn no more than 15.0 million standard cubic feet of natural gas in that Furnace.

3. SO<sub>2</sub> limit during Malfunction of the Scrubber System or ESP – For any Operating Day where a Malfunction of the Scrubber System or ESP occurs for any period of time, SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions generated during that Operating Day (or Operating Days if the event covers more than one Operating Day) from the Removal Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average and Scrubber Outlet 30day Rolling Average emission rates. During the Malfunction Days excluded from the Removal Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average and Scrubber Outlet 30-day Rolling Average emission rates, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the following pound per day limit:

$$SO_{2 \ Scrub \ Malf} = 2.5 \frac{lb \ SO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]$$

Where:

 $SO_{2 \text{ Scrub Malf}} = SO_{2}$  emission limit for a

Furnace with a Semi-dry Scrubber during a

Malfunction Day, in pounds per day.

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL.

AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. - 65

5220 United States Courthouse 700 Stewart Street SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-1271 (206) 553-7970

UNITED STATES ATTORNEY



P = Furnace-specific production threshold as 1 defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass 2 3 produced per day. 4 4. SO<sub>2</sub> limit during Maintenance of the Scrubber 5 System- For any Operating Day where Maintenance activities on the Scrubber System or 6 ESP are performed, SGCI may elect to exclude the 7 8 Maintenance Day from the Removal Efficiency 30-9 day Rolling Average and Scrubber Outlet 30-day Rolling Average emission rates. For any Day 10 which is excluded from the 30-day Rolling 11 12 Average, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate 13 compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the 14 following pound per day:  $\frac{MH \times \left[2.5 \frac{lbSO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]\right]}{24} + \frac{MH \times \left[\frac{1}{3} \times 2.5 \frac{lbSO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]\right]}{24}$ SO2 Scrub Maint 15 16 17 Where:  $SO_{2 \text{ Scrub Maint}} = SO_{2}$  emission limit for a Furnace with a Semi-Dry Scrubber during a 18 19 Maintenance Day, in pounds per day. 20 P = Furnace-specific production threshold as defined in Paragraph 10 in tons of glass 21 22 produced per day. 23 MH = Hours of Maintenance NH = Normal Hours = 24 - MH24 d. For the Furnaces Equipped with Dry Scrubbers 25

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	

- i. No later than the first Operating Day after the dates specified in Table 3, SGCI shall Operate the Furnace passing all stack gases through a Dry Scrubber except during periods of Control Device Startup, up to the first seven (7) days of the Furnace Startup, and during Malfunction of the Scrubber System or ESP and Maintenance on the Scrubber System or ESP.
- ii. SGCI shall comply with the following applicable SO<sub>2</sub> limits for Furnaces with Dry Scrubbers:
  - 1. SO<sub>2</sub> 30-day Rolling Average Limit Commencing on the first Operating Day after completion of the Control Device Startup and CEMS Certification, but no later than the date specified in Table 3, a Furnace equipped with a Dry Scrubber shall comply with the following limits as measured using an SO<sub>2</sub> CEMS, except during the following periods (as set forth in this Subparagraph): Control Device Startup, up to the first seven (7) days of Furnace Startup, Malfunction of the Scrubber System or

1	FQD	and Maintenance of the Scrubber System or
		and mannenance of the Schubber System of
2	ESP.	
3	a.	No dilution air will be intentionally added to
4		the stack gases between the Scrubber System
5		and the CEMS. When determining
6	·	compliance with all Scrubber limits, there
7		shall be no oxygen correction, as per vendor
8		guarantee.
9	b.	SGCI shall determine a daily Inlet 24-Hour
10		Block Average. The compliance limit for
11		each Operating Day will depend on the daily
12		Inlet 24-hour Block Average and will either
13		be as defined in 8.d.ii.1.c. or 8.d.ii.1.d., but
14		not both.
15	c.	If the average daily Inlet calculated in
16		Subparagraph 8.d.ii.1.b is equal to or greater
17		than 167 parts per million by volume dry
18	·	(ppmvd) then the Removal Efficiency on a
19		24-hour Block Average for that Day and a
20		Removal Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average



1	shall be calculated. SGCI must operate the
2	Dry Scrubber such that the Removal
3	Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average is greater
4	than or equal to 70 percent.
5	d. If the average daily Inlet calculated in
6	Subparagraph 8.d.ii.1.b. is less than 167
7	ppmvd, then the Outlet 24-hour Block
8	Average for that Day and Outlet 30-day
9	Rolling Average shall be calculated. SGCI
10	must operate the Dry Scrubber such that the
11	Outlet 30-day Rolling Average is less than or
12	equal to 50 ppmvd.
13	2. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Control Device Startup or up to
14	the first seven (7) days of Furnace Startup –SGCI
15	shall comply with the following operational limit to
16	limit SO <sub>2</sub> emissions during all phases of Control
17	Device Startup or up to the first seven (7) days of
18	Furnace Startup:
19	a. During the startup period, SGCI will limit the
20	amount of sulfur added to the batch materials

1	SOURCE CONTRACTOR OF THE CONTR
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	

- to 2.6 pounds per ton of total batch material (including cullet) or less.
- b. For no more than the first seven (7) Days of
  Furnace Startup, the Furnace exhaust may
  bypass the Scrubber System to avoid having
  the operating inlet temperature of the
  Scrubber System fall below its operational
  range. During these bypass Days, SGCI shall
  burn no more than 15.0 million standard
  cubic feet of natural gas in that furnace.
- 3. SO<sub>2</sub> limit during Malfunction of the Scrubber System or ESP For any Operating Day where a Malfunction of the Scrubber System or ESP occurs for any period of time, SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions generated during that Operating Day (or Operating Days if the event covers more than one Operating Day) from the Removal Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average and Scrubber Outlet 30-day Rolling Average emission rates. During the Malfunction Days excluded from the Removal

H

Efficiency 30-day Rolling Average and Scrubber 1 2 Outlet 30-day Rolling Average emission rates, a CEMS shall be used to demonstrate compliance on 3 4 a 24-hour Block Average with the following pound 5 per day limit:  $SO_{2 Scrub Malf} = 2.5 \frac{lb SO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]$ 6  $SO_{2 Scrub Malf} = SO_{2}$  emission limit for a 7 Where: Furnace with a Dry Scrubber during a 8 9 Malfunction Day, in pounds per day. 10 P = Furnace-specific production threshold as 11 defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass 12 produced per day. 4. SO<sub>2</sub> limit during Maintenance of the Scrubber 13 14 System or ESP– For any Operating Day where 15 Maintenance activities on the Scrubber System or 16 ESP are performed, SGCI may elect to exclude the 17 Maintenance Day from the Removal Efficiency 30-18 day Rolling Average and Scrubber Outlet 30-day 19 Rolling Average emission rates. For any 20 Maintenance Day which is excluded from the 30-

21

day Rolling Average, a CEMS shall be used to

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22



demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block

Average with the following pound per day limit:

$$SO_{2~Scrub~Maint} = \frac{MH \times \left[2.5\frac{lb~SO_2}{ton}~\times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]\right]}{24} + \frac{NH \times \left[\frac{2}{3} \times 2.5\frac{lb~SO_2}{ton}~\times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]\right]}{24}$$

Where: SO<sub>2 Scrub Maint</sub> = SO<sub>2</sub> emission limit for a
Furnace with a Dry Scrubber during a
Maintenance Day, in pounds per day
P = Furnace-specific production threshold as

defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass

produced per day

MH = Hours of Maintenance NH = Normal Hours = 24 – MH

- e. For Furnaces with Cloud Chamber Scrubber Systems
  - i. SGCI may install a CCSS instead of a Semi-dry Scrubber under Paragraph 8.c. For any Furnace which SGCI elects to use a CCSS, after up to the first seven (7) days of the Furnace Startup after the next Major Rebuild, but no later than the first Operating Day after the dates specified in Table 3, SGCI shall Operate the Furnace passing all stack gases through the CCSS except during periods of Control Device Startup, Malfunction of the CCSS and Maintenance on the CCSS. If SGCI uses a CCSS in lieu of a Semi-dry Scrubber, it must notify the United States and the State.

1	ii. SO <sub>2</sub> 30-day Rolling Average Limit – Commencing on the
2	first Operating Day after completion of the Control Device
3	Startup and CEMS Certification, but no later than the date
4	specified in Table 3, SGCI shall comply with all
5	requirements in 8.c.ii.
6	iii. Compliance with the above emissions limitations shall be
7	measured using an SO <sub>2</sub> CEMS.
8	f. Seattle #5 Cloud Chamber Scrubber System – SGCI installed a CCSS
9	on the Seattle Furnace #5 in 2007. If SGCI removes or discontinues
10	operation of the CCSS, it shall, within 9 months of permanently ceasing to
11	operate the CCSS, construct and operate a Semi-dry Scrubber in order to
12	pass all stack gases through a Semi-dry Scrubber that meets the emissions
13	standards in 8.c.ii.
14	g. For Furnaces listed in Table 4
15	i. Process controls may include technologies and methods that
16	are currently undertaken or will be undertaken to reduce
17	$SO_2$ emissions.
18	ii. Process controls shall be implemented at the following
19	Furnaces and will be referred to as "Furnaces listed in Table
20	4."



Table 4 – Process-Controlled Furnaces

rable 4 - Frocess-Conductied Furnaces
Port Allegany Furnace #1
Port Allegany Furnace #3
Henderson Furnace #1
Henderson Furnace #2
Wilson Furnace #28
Wilson Furnace #29
Burlington Furnace #6
Burlington Furnace #7
Sapulpa Furnace #50
Sapulpa Furnace #51
Sapulpa Furnace #52
Lincoln Furnace
Ruston Furnace #1
Ruston Furnace #2
Seattle Furnace #2
Seattle Furnace #3
Seattle Furnace #4

iii. By no later than June 30, 2015, SGCI shall submit a

complete application to the State/local permitting authority

for two federally-enforceable SO<sub>2</sub> emission limits measured

on a 30-day Rolling Average Emission Rate for each of the

Furnaces listed in Table 4. One limit applies during times

when the Furnace is producing flint (clear) glass and the

other applies when the Furnace is producing colored (any

other) glass. Both limits must be expressed in the form of

3

1

2

6

5

8



pounds of SO<sub>2</sub> per ton of glass produced. No proposed SO<sub>2</sub> 1 limit can be higher than 2.5 pounds per ton of glass 2 produced, determined as a 30-day rolling average. The 3 limit shall apply during all Operating Days except during 4 Furnace Startup, Maintenance of the Furnace, Malfunction 5 of the Furnace, Color Transition, and Abnormally Low 6 7 Production Rate Days. For these exception periods, SGCI shall obtain federally-enforceable SO<sub>2</sub> emission limits as 8 follows: 9 10 1. SO<sub>2</sub> Limit during Abnormally Low Production Rate Days - For any Abnormally Low Production Rate 11 Day SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions 12 generated during that Day from the Emission Rate 13 30-day Rolling Average. During these Days, a 14 15 CEMS shall be used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block Average with the following pound 16 per day limit: 17  $SO_{2 \ 2nd \ Abn} = [Applicable \ Permit \ Limit] \frac{lb \ SO_{2}}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]$ 18 Where:  $SO_{2 \text{ 2nd Abn}} = SO_{2}$  emission limit for a

19

20

Furnace listed in Table 4 during an

Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ Document 2-2 Filed 01/21/2010 Page 76 of 88

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, in pounds per day.  Applicable Permit Limit = This is the permit limit that SGCI receives for each Furnace listed in Table 4 under Paragraph 8.g.iii for Color or Flint, whichever is currently being melted, in lb SO <sub>2</sub> per ton of glass.  P = Furnace-specific production threshold as defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass produced per day.
11	2. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Furnace Startup –SGCI shall
12	comply with the following operational limit to limit
13	SO <sub>2</sub> emissions during all phases of Furnace Startup:
14	a. During the startup period, SGCI will limit the
15	amount of sulfur added to the batch materials
16	to 2.6 pounds per ton of total batch material
17	(including cullet) or less.
18	3. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Malfunction of the Furnace – For
19	any Operating Day where a Malfunction of the
20	Furnace system occurs for any period of time,
21	SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions generated
22	during that Operating Day (or Operating Days if the
23	event covers more than one Operating Day) from
24	the Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average. During
- 1	

2

3

4

5

6

7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20



the Malfunction Days excluded from the Emission

Rate 30-day Rolling Average, a CEMS shall be

used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block

Average with the following pound per day limit:

$$SO_{2 \ 2nd \ Malf} = 3 \times 2.5 \frac{lb \ SO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.35}\right]$$

Where: SO<sub>2 2nd Malf</sub>= SO<sub>2</sub> emission limit for a Furnace listed in Table 4 during a Malfunction Day, in pounds per day. P = Furnace-specific production threshold as defined in Paragraph 10 in tons of glass produced per day.

4. SO2 limit during Maintenance – For any Operating
Day where Maintenance activities on the Furnace
are performed, SGCI may elect to exclude the
Maintenance Day from the Emission Rate 30-day
Rolling Average. For any Day which is excluded
from the 30-day Rolling Average, a CEMS shall be
used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour Block
Average with the following pound per day limit:

$$SO_{2\ 2nd\ Maint} = \frac{MH \times [3 \times 2.5 \frac{lb\ SO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{P}{0.55}\right]]}{24} + \frac{NH \times \left[\frac{P}{0.55}\right] \times [App\ Limit] \frac{lb\ SO_2}{ton}}{24}$$

Case 2:10-cv-00121-TSZ

Document 2-2

Filed 01/21/2010

Page 78 of 88



1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Where: SO <sub>2 2nd Maint</sub> = SO <sub>2</sub> emission limit for a Furnace listed in Table 4 during a Maintenance Day, in pounds per day.  P = Furnace-specific production threshold as defined in Paragraph 10 in tons of glass produced per day.  MH = Hours of Maintenance  NH = Normal Hours = 24 – MH  App Limit = This is the permit limit that SGCI receives for each Furnace listed in Table 4 under Paragraph 8.g.iii for Color or Flint, whichever is currently being melted, in lb SO <sub>2</sub> per ton of glass.
14	5. SO <sub>2</sub> limit during Color Transition – For any
15	Operating Day on which a Color Transition occurs
16	SGCI may elect to exclude the emissions generated
17	during that Day from the Emission Rate 30-day
18	Rolling Average. During these Days, a CEMS shall
19	be used to demonstrate compliance on a 24-hour
20	Block Average with the following pound per day
21	limit:
22	$SO_{2  2nd  Col  Tran} = 2 \times 2.5 \frac{lb  SO_2}{ton} \times \left[\frac{p}{0.35}\right]$
23 24 25 26 27 28	Where: SO <sub>2 2nd Col Tran</sub> = SO <sub>2</sub> emission limit for a Furnace listed in Table 4 during a Color Transition Day, in pounds per day.  P = Furnace-specific production threshold as defined in Paragraph 10, in tons of glass produced per day.

1	iv.	Following the submission of a complete permit application,
2		SGCI shall cooperate with the applicable State/local
3		permitting authority by promptly submitting all information
4		requested by the State/local permitting authority.
5	v.	At the Wilson Facility, by December 31, 2011, SGCI shall
6		apply for SO <sub>2</sub> limits of 400 tons of SO <sub>2</sub> per Calendar Year
7		for Furnaces #28 and #29 combined, as measured by SO <sub>2</sub>
8		CEMS.
9	vi.	By no later than June 30, 2015, SGCI shall apply for
10		permanent SO <sub>2</sub> emission limits in compliance with 8.g.iii-
11		xii. for all Furnaces listed in Table 4 through Permits issued
12		by the State/local agency.
13	vii.	SGCI shall continuously comply with each proposed SO <sub>2</sub>
14		emission limit starting on the date of the Permit application
15		and throughout the duration of the Consent Decree except
16		during periods of Abnormally Low Production Rate Days,
17		Furnace Startup, Malfunction of the Furnace, Maintenance
18		of the Furnace, and Color Transition.
19	viii.	An SO <sub>2</sub> CEMS shall be used to demonstrate compliance
20		with the SO <sub>2</sub> limits for Furnaces listed in Table 4.

1	ix.	Once all Furnaces I
2		with 30-day Rolling
3		System-wide Weigh
4		Emission Rate Perm
5		4 obtained for flint
6		pounds of SO <sub>2</sub> per t
7	x.	Once all Furnaces l
8		with 30-day Rolling
9		SO <sub>2</sub> System-wide V
10		Average Emission l
11		in Table 4 obtained
12		than 2.25 pounds of
13	xi.	Beginning in the 20
14		December 31, 2015
15		Weighted Annual A
16		than 1.95 pounds of
17		year the weighted a
18		Table 4 equipped w
19		and production from

- ix. Once all Furnaces listed in Table 4 have received a Permit with 30-day Rolling Average limits for flint glass, the SO<sub>2</sub>

  System-wide Weighted Average of 30-day Rolling Average Emission Rate Permit Limits of all Furnaces listed in Table 4 obtained for flint glass shall not be greater than 1.95 pounds of SO<sub>2</sub> per ton of glass produced.
- x. Once all Furnaces listed in Table 4 have received a Permit with 30-day Rolling Average limits for colored glass, the SO<sub>2</sub> System-wide Weighted Average of 30-day Rolling Average Emission Rate Permit Limits of all Furnaces listed in Table 4 obtained for colored glass shall not be greater than 2.25 pounds of SO<sub>2</sub> per ton of glass produced.
- December 31, 2015, SGCI shall achieve System-wide

  Weighted Annual Average Actual Emissions of no greater
  than 1.95 pounds of SO<sub>2</sub> per ton of glass produced. Each
  year the weighted average will include all Furnaces listed in
  Table 4 equipped with CEMS and will include emissions
  and production from any color of glass. This limit shall
  include emissions from all times the Furnaces are firing fuel

except Abnormally Low Production Rate Days, Furnace
Startup, Malfunction, Maintenance of the Furnace, and
Color Transition.

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

xii. By no later than 6 months after all Furnaces listed in Table 4 have received Permits with 30-day Rolling Average limits for flint and colored glass, SGCI shall submit a report that demonstrates compliance with Paragraph 8.g.ii. to 8.g.xi. including, but not limited to, all applicable Permits containing the SO<sub>2</sub> emission limits for the Furnaces listed in Table 4 and a calculation of the SO<sub>2</sub> System-wide Weighted Average Permit Limit for flint under Paragraph 8.g.ix. and colored glass under Paragraph 8.g.x.

h. Monitoring: A CEMS, if available, shall be used to demonstrate compliance with the SO<sub>2</sub> limits in Paragraphs 8.c. through 8.g. using data generated by the SO<sub>2</sub> CEMS. If the Facility does not have a CEMS when it is required to meet the limit in Paragraphs 8.c. through 8.g. above, compliance shall be demonstrated using data generated from annual stack tests complying with 40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A. If a CEMS Certification Event occurs, then the requirement to demonstrate compliance continuously with the limit for that Furnace will be suspended until

Certification is completed (provided the seven-day test required fo	r
Certification is commenced the first Operating Day following the	conclusion
of the CEMS Certification Event).	:

- i. Existing State/Local Limits: The limits in Paragraph 8 do not replace any current State/local limits and do not relieve SGCI of its obligation to comply with those limits.
- j. Recordkeeping: For any Operating Day that SGCI is excluding emissions from the relevant Emission Rate 30-day Rolling Average, it shall record the date, the exception (Abnormally Low Production Rate Day, Furnace Startup, Furnace Malfunction, Furnace Maintenance, or Color Transition) under which it is excluded, a calculation of the applicable limit (pounds per day) according to the equations above, and the recorded emissions according to the CEMS, if a certified CEMS is available (in pounds per day).
- k. Recordkeeping and Reporting during Furnace Startup: In addition to the record keeping in Subparagraph j. above, during all Furnace Startup phases SGCI must also keep the following records:
  - i. During the startup period, SGCI will record the amount of sulfur added to the batch materials in pounds per ton of total batch material.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

1	1. Where a Facility has more than one Furnace subject to the same
2	emission limit, compliance with the 30-day rolling average limits set forth
3	herein may be determined by averaging the emissions from all Furnaces
4	subject to the same emission limit at a given Facility.
5	m. For the Furnaces at Burlington, Wilson, and Seattle, the limits set
6	forth in or determined in accordance with Paragraph 8 shall be increased by
7	2.0 pounds per ton when burning fuel oil. If additional Furnaces are allowed
8	by a Permit to burn fuel oil, the required limit under this Consent Decree
9	shall be increased by 2.0 pounds per ton for periods when burning fuel oil.
10	No Furnace may combust fuel oil which has a sulfur content in excess of 0.5
11	percent, by weight.
12	n. Compliance with a Sulfuric Acid Mist emission limit of 1.0 pounds
13	per ton of glass produced shall be demonstrated by a stack test performed
14	using Conditional Test Method 13A or B on all Furnaces on or before
15	December 31, 2011. Stack testing shall be required to be performed after
16	this initial test only once during the life of each Title V permit renewal.
17	9. PM Emission Controls, Limits, and Compliance Schedule
18	a. Interim PM Emission Limit:
19	i. On and after the first stack test following the Date of Entry,
20	SGCI shall comply with an interim PM emission limit of

1		1.0 pound of filterable PM per ton of glass produced on all
2		glass Furnaces listed in Table 5 (except for Milford #15 and
3		#16, and Seattle #5).
4	ii.	Except for the Dolton facility, compliance with this interim
5		PM emission limit shall be demonstrated by conducting an
6		EPA Method 5 (40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A) source test.
7		Testing shall be conducted initially no later than 12 months
8		after the Date of Entry and once each Calendar Year
9		thereafter.
10	iii.	For the Dolton Facility, compliance with the interim PM
11		emission limit shall be demonstrated by conducting an EPA
12		Method 5 (40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A) source test on
13		each of the three Furnaces. Testing on each of the three
14		Furnaces shall be conducted initially no later than
15		December 31, 2009, and then once again between January
16		1, 2011, and December 31, 2011.
17	iv.	The interim PM emission limit shall remain in effect until
18		the Furnace is required to comply with a PM emission limit
19		specified in Paragraph 9.c. through 9.h. below. Stack
20		testing for demonstration of compliance with interim limits

2

3

4

5

6

7

shall not be required in a Calendar Year during which compliance with limits determined under Paragraphs 9.c. or 9.d. is demonstrated.

- PM Emission Controls and Compliance Schedule b.
  - i. For each Furnace in Table 5, SGCI shall operate one of the PM emission control devices or methods specified for that Furnace in Table 5.

<u>Table 5 – Controls for Particulate Matter and Compliance Schedule</u>

Facility and	Controls	Deadline
Furnace #		- CONTRACTOR
Seattle #5	CCSS – See Section 9.e.	See Section 9.e.
Milford #15 & #16	Electrostatic Precipitator, or CCSS	December 31, 2015
Dunkirk #1 & #2	Electrostatic Precipitator, or CCSS	December 31, 2012
Waxahachie	Electrostatic Precipitator, or CCSS	December 31, 2013
Pevely #20 & #21	Electrostatic Precipitator, or CCSS	December 31, 2013
Dolton #1, #2, & #3	Electrostatic Precipitator	December 31, 2014
Port Allegany #1	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2009
Port Allegany #3	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2013
Henderson #1	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2014
Henderson #2	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2009
Lincoln	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2016
Burlington #6	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2012
Burlington #7	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2013
Sapulpa #50	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2015
Sapulpa #51	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2010
Sapulpa #52	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2011
Ruston #1	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2012
Ruston #2	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2012
	and 9.g.	
Seattle #2	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2015
Seattle #3	Process controls – See Section 9.f.	December 31, 2015
Seattle #4	Process controls – See Section 9.f	December 31, 2012

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. - 85

UNITED STATES ATTORNEY **5220 United States Courthouse** 700 STEWART STREET SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-1271 (206) 553-7970



Wilson #28	Process controls – See Section 9.f. and 9.h.	December 31, 2012
Wilson #29	Process controls – See Section 9.f. and 9.h.	December 31, 2012

## c. For Furnaces with Electrostatic Precipitator

- i. After up to the first seven (7) days of the Furnace Startup period following the next Major Rebuild (except Milford Furnace #15 and Pevely Furnace #21), but no later than the first Operating Day after the dates specified in Table 5, SGCI shall Operate the Furnace passing all stack gases through an Electrostatic Precipitator (ESP), except during periods of Control Device Startup, Malfunction of the ESP, and Maintenance of the ESP.
- ii. SGCI shall comply with the PM emission limit of 0.2 pounds of filterable PM per ton of glass produced (or 0.26 pounds of filterable PM per ton of glass produced when the Furnace is fired on fuel oil) and 0.45 pounds of total PM per ton of glass produced (or 0.51 pounds of total PM per ton of glass produced when the Furnace is fired on fuel oil) for those Furnaces equipped with an ESP but no SCR.

  Furnaces equipped with an ESP and an SCR shall comply with the PM emission limit of 0.2 pounds of filterable PM

CONSENT DECREE BETWEEN PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ET AL. AND DEFENDANT SAINT-GOBAIN CONTAINERS, INC. – 86

UNITED STATES ATTORNEY
5220 UNITED STATES COURTHOUSE
700 STEWART STREET
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-1271
(206) 553-7970

1	per ton of glass produced (or 0.26 pounds of filterable PM
2	per ton of glass produced when the Furnace is fired on fuel
3	oil); for such Furnaces there shall be no limit for total or
4	condensable PM.
5	iii. Compliance with the PM limit shall be demonstrated
6	through annual stack tests. SGCI shall conduct an initial
7	stack test on each Furnace no later than twelve (12) months
8	after the applicable compliance date listed in Table 5 and
9	once each Calendar Year thereafter.
10	1. Filterable PM shall be determined using EPA
11	Method 5 (40 C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A).
12	2. Total PM shall be determined using Method 5 (40
13	C.F.R. Part 60 Appendix A) and EPA Method 202
14	(40 C.F.R. Part 51 Appendix M).
15	d. For Furnaces with Cloud Chamber Scrubber System
L6	i. SGCI may install a CCSS instead of an ESP. For any Furnace
L7	where SGCI elects to use a CCSS instead of an ESP, after the
18	first seven (7) days of the Furnace Startup period following
19	next Major Rebuild, but no later than the first Operating Day
- 1	

after the dates specified in Table 5, SGCI shall Operate the

Furnace passing all stack gases through a CCSS except during
periods of Control Device Startup, Malfunction of the CCSS,
and Maintenance of the CCSS.
ii. If SGCI uses a CCSS in lieu of an ESP, it must notify the
United States and the State.
iii. Any CCSS installed in lieu of an ESP (excluding the
experimental CCSS installed on Seattle Furnace #5) shall
comply with all requirements in 9.c.ii. and 9.c.iii.
e. Seattle #5 Cloud Chamber Scrubber System – SGCI installed a CCS
on the Seattle Furnace #5 in 2007. If SGCI removes or discontinues

nstalled a CCSS ontinues operation of the CCSS, it shall, within nine (9) months of permanently ceasing to operate the CCSS, construct and operate an ESP in order to pass all stack gases through an ESP that meets the emissions standards in 9.c.

- f. PM Emission Limits for Furnaces listed in Table 4
  - i. For each Furnace listed in Table 4, SGCI shall comply with the PM emission limit of 1.0 pound of total PM per ton of glass produced for each Furnace by the dates specified in Table 5.
  - ii. Compliance with the PM limits in Paragraph 9.f.i. shall be demonstrated by annual stack tests. Total PM shall be

20

19

1

2

3

4

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17